

CCT: A Genetic Analysis of TS, RC. Pericope 28.

WR	SR TB	WW	WC	GL1	TS	RC
Damned by mortification - - - a lake as of fire of brimstone - as exquisite the disappointment of the mind of man - - - - - Why? Must commit the unpardonable sin in this world. will suffer in the eternal world until he will be exalted.- work of the devil. the plans the devil laid to save the world. - Devil said he could save them all - Lot fell on Jesus. = - - - All	<i>a sinner has his own mind & is in his own condemner for the G.</i> <i>will the torment of the mind of man¹ is as exquisite as a lake burng. with fire & brimstone - I know the Scriptures I understand them- no man can commit the unpardonable sin after the dissn. of the body but they must do it in this world- hence the Saln. of J. C was wrought out for all men to triumph over the devil-for he stood up for a Savior-J. contd. that there wod. be certn. souls that wod. be condemned & the dl sd. he cod. save them all²-as the grand council gave in for J. C. so the dl fell & all who put up their</i>	his own mind³ damns him I have no fear of hell fire that dont exist No man can commit the unpardonable sin, untill he receives the Holy Ghost, All will suffer untill they obey Christ himself, even the devil said I am a savior and can save all, he rose up in rebellion against God and was cast down,. Jesus Christ will save all except the sons of perdition. What must a man do to commit the unpardonable	A man is his own torment hence the saying they shall go into the lake that burns with fire &c a as exquisite as a lake &c so is the torments of a man - I said no man could commit the unpardonable sin after the dissolution of the body - hence the salvation that the saviour wrought out for the salvation of a man if it did not catch him in one place it would another - The contention in heaven was Jesus said there were certain man would not be saved the devil said he could save them . he rebelled against God and was thrust down. After a man has sinned the sin	But those who die without the obedience of the gospel here will have to obey it in the world of spirits for so long as they do not obey they will be miserable and as if they were in torment of fire and brimstone. Thus is the signification of torment . . . But Satan, or Lucifer, being the next heir⁵ and had allotted to him great power and authority even prince of power of the air.⁶ He spake immediately and boasted of	A man is his own tormenter,⁹ and is his own condemner: hence the saying they shall go into the lake that burns with fire and brimstone.¹⁰ The torment of the mind of man is as exquisite as a lake burning with fire and brimstone¹¹ - so is the torment of man.¹² I know the scriptures; I understand them. I said no man can commit the unpardonable sin after the dissolution of the body, but they must do it in this world:¹³ hence the salvation of Jesus Christ was wrought out for all men in order to triumph over the devil: for if it did not catch him in one place, it would in another, for he stood up as a Savior. The contention in heaven was, Jesus said there	A man is his own tormentor, and his own condemner; hence the saying, they shall go into the lake that burns with fire and brimstone. The torment of disappointment in the mind of man is as exquisite as a lake burning with fire and brimstone - I say so is the torment of man. I know the scriptures and understand them. I said no man can commit the unpardonable sin after the dissolution of the body, nor in the life, until he receives the Holy Ghost; but they must do it in this world; hence the salvation of Jesus Christ was wrought out for all men in order to triumph over the Devil;²⁷ for if it did not catch him in one place, it would in another; for he stood up as a Savior. All will suffer until they obey Christ himself. The contention in heaven was, Jesus said there would not be saved, and the Devil said he could save them all, and laid his plans before the Grand Council, who gave their vote

sin &c forgiven except the sin against the Holy Ghost. - Got to deny the plan of salvation . &c. with his eyes open. - Like many **of the** apostates of **Christ**[?] of the Church of Jesus Christ of lat Days.

heads for him all sin shall be forgiven except the sin agn. the H. G. he has got to say that the Sun does not shine while he sees it he has got to deny J. C. when the heavens **are** open to him. & from that time they begin to be enemies like many **of the** apostates of the Church of J. C. of L.D.S. - when a man begins to be an enemy he hunts **him**—**for** he **has** the same Sp. that they had who crucd. the Lord of life—the same Sp. that Sin agn. the H. G.

sin **they** must receive the Holy Ghost have the heavens opened unto **them**, & know God, & then sin against him, this is the case with many apostates in **this** Church, **they** never seease to **try to hurt me**, **they have got the devil had**, you cannot save **them**, they make open war like the devil,

against the H **S**. there is no repentance for him. **Hence like many of the** apostates of the C of J. C. L.D.S. **they go to far the spirit leaves them hence they seek to kill me they thirst for my blood—they neve cease—he has got the same spirit that crucified Jesus.** You can't renew them to repentance⁴—awful is the consequence.

himself saying send me I can save all and [he] sinned against the Holy Ghost because he accused his brethren and was hurled from the counsel for striving to break the law immediately.⁷ There was a warfare with Satan and the gods and they hurled Satan out of his place and all them that would not keep the sayings of the council. But he himself being one of the councilors would not keep the first estate for he was one of the sons of perdition and consequently all the sons of

would be certain souls that would **not** be saved,¹⁴ and the devil¹⁵ said he could save them all,¹⁶ the grand council gave in for Jesus Christ:¹⁷ so the devil¹⁸ rebelled against God and fell, and all who put up their heads for him. All sins shall be forgiven except the sin against the Holy Ghost:¹⁹ after a man has sinned against the Holy Ghost there is no repentance for him, he has got to say that the sun does not shine, while he sees it, he has got to deny Jesus Christ when the heavens **were** open to him,²⁰ and from that time they begin to be enemies, like many of the apostates of the church²¹ of Jesus Christ of Latter day²² Saints.²³ When a man begins to be an enemy, **the**²⁴ **hunts me.** **They seek to kill me; they thirst for my blood; they never cease.** He has the same spirit that they had who crucified the Lord of

in **favor of** Jesus Christ;²⁸ so the Devil rose up in rebellion against God, and was cast down **with** all who put up their heads for him. All sins shall be forgiven except the sin against the Holy Ghost; **for** Jesus will save all except the sons of perdition.²⁹ What must a man do to commit the unpardonable sin? **he**³⁰ must receive the Holy Ghost, have the heavens opened unto **him**, and know God , and then sin against **him**:³¹ after a man has sinned against the Holy Ghost there is no repentance for him; he has got to say that the sun does not shine while he sees it- he has got to deny Jesus Christ when the heavens **have been** opened unto him, **and** to deny the plan of salvation with his eyes open³² **to the truth of it**; and from that time **he** begins to be an enemy. **This is the case with many** apostates of the church of Jesus Christ of Latter day Saints. When a man begins to be an enemy **to this work**, he hunts **me** - **he seeks to kill me, and never ceases to thirst for my blood.** He gets the spirit of the Devil – the same spirit that sins³³ against the Holy Ghost. **You cannot save such persons**³⁴ – **you cannot bring them to repentance;**

perdition
become devils.⁸ Life:²⁵ the same spirit that they make open war like the
sins against the Holy Devil³⁵ and awful is the
Ghost. You cannot bring consequence.
them to repentance.²⁶
Awful is the consequence.

¹ The word “mind” as used here suggests the meaning that would apply to the earlier portions of the discourse. The word “mind” is attested by WW.

² WW attests to this remark.

³ It appears that TB and WW give some aspect of the same archetypal phrasing, but imperfectly. WW's statement that the sinner's own mind damn's him is suggested also by WR.

⁴ Heb. 6:4-6.

⁵ GL gives some detail of rank in the council, putting Lucifer in a position near God. The council is a biblical construct and present in pre-exilic Judaism. (See for example, Cross *Hebrew Epic*; Barker *The Great Angel*.)

⁶ Eph. 2:2. GL's version is interesting in that it may give further insight into JS's words, though it may combine other insights from JS with those in the present sermon.

⁷ There is a fascinating unity here between the JS's concept of the "sin against the Holy Ghost" in mankind and Satan's sin in the preexistence. Perhaps the stricture JS places upon this sin in mortality (it cannot be done after death) does not apply to the premortal realm. See the following note.

⁸ The implication is that those designated as sons of perdition, are called by that name because they commit precisely the same transgression as Lucifer.

⁹ The VOT has [tormentor].

¹⁰ The RC has [brimstone].[^] The torment of the Mind of Man is as exquisite as a lake burning with fire and brimstone;] the insertion is in darker ink and possibly a different hand.

¹¹ The Clayton and Bullock accounts probably report the same archetypal phrase here, i.e. the opening sentences of both accounts report the same part of the speech imperfectly.

¹² There is some redundancy in the construction here. The idea of mental self-torment went against much of the usual imagery associated with hell. But it fit perfectly with JS's notion of preexistence, where those on earth actually had a history in heaven and made active choice of mortal life in hope of eternal felicity. The regret of failure that would ensue with the restoration of memory of that history would certainly be painful. Moreover, the Book of Mormon suggests that such torment is mental with the experience of Alma (e.g., Alma 38:6-8) (cp. 2Ne 9: 16, 19, 26; 2Ne 28:23; Jacob 3:11; Rev. 21:8; Rev. 19:20; D&C 63:17; D&C 76:36.) Traditional Christian views of hell involved some form of endless corporeal pain, characterized by burning, suggested by, among other passages, the “lake of fire” in Rev. 19 and 21. The addition of brimstone (sulfur)

suggests the terrible smell of the place as well. The notion of hell-fire in the New Testament followed contemporary Jewish tradition. The image of burning derived from the burning trash heap on the south side of Jerusalem (the Valley of Hinnom) where anciently human sacrifice to Moloch had taken place. The location came to symbolically represent the place of divine punishment. However it was undoubtedly the smell of the place that created the most awful memories. The notion was common enough to be employed with some irony by Jesus in his discussion of sin outside the usual Hebrew canon, for example, calling someone a fool (Matt. 5:22). It was also a Roman notion that suggested continual burning of the body as a punishment. Since JS eschewed the doctrine of annihilation, this meant an eternal experience of physical pain apparently. However, in JS's theology, the pain is mental and self-inflicted and even then, in all but the most extreme cases, of finite duration. There is little notion of a supratemporal eternal in nineteenth-century Mormonism. Passages in Mormon scripture suggesting that God is outside of time in some way are nearly always taken in an allegorical sense, a view required by a belief in a material God as the latter was understood by JS. The idea of hell is connected to the doctrine of grace, which JS discusses in a sermon of March 10, 1844.

¹³ Or as pointed out elsewhere, before this world. Apparently, JS understands that the prerequisites for this fate are not available after death. He does not explain his reasoning on this point, but see note 26.

¹⁴ JS suggests that the war in heaven was fought precisely over the *possibility* of the "sin against the Holy Ghost." That is, the theoretical possibility that some would qualify for that condemnation, which would be without redemption (of course one might also regard it as prophecy). Lucifer is styled as countering that with elimination of this possibility. This would of course either remove the possibility of choosing that course of action, or changing the penalty for dishonoring the Holy Ghost. The latter suggests a kind of reduction of status for the Holy Ghost, one of the three, who according to JS had covenanted in the preexistence to form the Godhead as the means to save mankind [see McIntire's minute book for March 9, 1841 and Clayton's Private Book (PJ), 10-11; also Facs. 3 explanation 1, Book of Abraham]. This course of action involved Lucifer in a conspiracy to usurp the authority of the council and in fact place him as God ("wherefore, give me thine honor"). Either course would have been repugnant to the council, which resulted in Lucifer's ejection from the body, etc. There is heavy irony here, in that this scenario makes Lucifer and company guilty of the same sin they hoped to eliminate on earth. They were then subjected to the same penalty (eventually) that the earthly "sons" of perdition would claim, through apparently the same motivation. A related concept here is the meaning of salvation. In the system JS presented, salvation was a reward that had degrees, celestial, terrestrial and telestial. Only those not meriting one of these rewards were not saved. JS's narratives place Lucifer in the role of impersonator of God, Jesus and angels, e.g. D&C 128:20; 2 Cor. 11:14; Moses 1.

¹⁵ The ms history has [Devil].

¹⁶ Also attested by the JS diary.

¹⁷ The text suggests that the plans were presented only to the "Grand Counselors," i.e. the council designated by the Book of Abraham as the "great and noble" and the "Gods." While this fits the profile of LDS leadership worked for by JS, he also indicated at a January 5, 1841 Nauvoo Lyceum that "At the first organization in heaven we were all present and saw the Savior chosen and appointed, and the plan of salvation made and we sanctioned it." [William Clayton's "private book," L. Tom Perry Special Collections Library, Brigham Young University (PJ).] The "first organization in heaven" perhaps refers to the organization of the council. [See Book of Abraham 3:22.] Hence, we might put the information together in this way: the council approved the plan, then the general population sustained it.

¹⁸ The ms history reads [Devil].

¹⁹ Phrase attested by JS diary.

²⁰ It is possible that JS is referring here to the temple rituals, which at least some of the current batch of church dissidents had received. The discussion here apparently hinges on Hebrews chapter 6: “For it is impossible for those who were once enlightened, and have tasted of the heavenly gift, and were made partakers of the Holy Ghost, And have tasted the good word of God, and the powers of the world to come, If they shall fall away, to renew them again unto repentance; seeing they crucify to themselves the Son of God afresh, and put him to an open shame. For the earth which drinketh in the rain that cometh oft upon it, and bringeth forth herbs meet for them by whom it is dressed, receiveth blessing from God: But that which beareth thorns and briers is rejected, and is nigh unto cursing; whose end is to be burned.”

²¹ The ms history reads [Church].

²² The ms history reads [Day]. The VOT reads [Latter-day].

²³ JS effectively places some of his critics, particularly those he believed were conspiring against his life, outside the purview of redemption. He may have placed John C. Bennett in this corps, the brothers William and Wilson Law as well as certain members of the Higbee and Foster families in Nauvoo. There were of course others outside of the church that used politics and press to promote his demise. The Expositor incident certainly played into the hands of his critics inside and outside of Mormonism. [See Leonard, *Nauvoo* ch. 13, Park, *Kingdom of Nauvoo*.]

²⁴ A possible typographical error. The print is not clear in some copies and may have been corrected during the print run. VOT has “he”. Ms history also reads “he”.

²⁵ It is not clear that this implies the crucifiers, or the judicial officers in the process would have been classed as sons of perdition, which seems to be a high bar. The required knowledge, by means of the Holy Ghost, is not in evidence in the NT texts. We might interpret the statement in terms of evil influences.

²⁶ It is implied here that once this transgression is made, that repentance becomes impossible, either because the person involved in the sin simply will not choose to repent, or that the option for repentance is removed. Given the title of this sin, perhaps the Holy Ghost withdraws influence permanently from the transgressor. JS gave instruction to the 12 apostles on June 27, 1839 and Willard Richards’ “pocket companion” records, “Faith comes by hearing the word of God through the testimony of the Servants of God, that Testimony is always attended by the Spirit of prophecy & Revelation” (PJ). Since faith and forgiveness are classified as gifts of the spirit, then these are no longer available. Whence it appears that repentance is neither desirable to the transgressor nor effective. The sons of perdition thus become a symbol for the decision of the grand council. On March 10, 1844, JS explained in more detail the relation between this sin and the priesthood sacraments he had introduced the previous year. There, JS compares his ideas to some popular interpretations of the day.

²⁷ GM1 reads [devil].

²⁸ While the image here follows the text of the Book of Abraham like some other parts of the sermon, its form is only partially represented in the source documents.

²⁹ Cp. D&C 76:42-45.

³⁰ GM1 reads [~~they~~^{he}].

³¹ GM1 reads [him].

³² While there is obvious redundancy in the construction here, this particular statement from the JS diary may suggest that JS is naming some apostates as sons of perdition because they have rejected the plan of salvation as revealed through JS. They may still consider themselves as not in the ranks of the condemned. This was certainly the case with some of his Nauvoo critics. Perhaps in JS's thought, those who had standing to become sons of perdition, if they indeed sought JS's demise, could be said to reject the Christian life.

³³ GM1 reads [same spirits that sin^s against].

³⁴ GM1 reads [save ~~them~~^{such persons}].

³⁵ GM1 reads [repentance;[^] they make open war like the devil and].